

SVENSKA INSTITUTEN I ATHEN OCH ROM
INSTITUTUM ATHENIENSE ATQUE INSTITUTUM ROMANUM REGNI SUECIAE

Opuscula

Annual of the Swedish Institutes at Athens and Rome

10
2017

STOCKHOLM

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE:

Prof. Gunnel Ekroth, Uppsala, Chairman
Prof. Arne Jönsson, Lund, Vice-chairman
Ms. Kristina Björkstén Jersenius, Stockholm, Treasurer
Dr. Erika Weiberg, Uppsala, Secretary
Prof. Karin Blomqvist, Lund
Prof. Peter M. Fischer, Göteborg
MA Axel Frejman, Uppsala
Dr. Kristian Göransson, Rome
Prof. Arja Karivieri, Stockholm
Dr. Emilie Karlsmo, Uppsala
Prof. Anne-Marie Leander Touati, Lund
Dr. Jenny Wallansten, Athens

EDITOR:

Dr. Petra Pakkanen
Department of Archaeology and Classical Studies
Stockholm University
SE-106 91 Stockholm
editor@ecsi.se

SECRETARY'S ADDRESS:

Department of Archaeology and Ancient History
Uppsala University
Box 626
SE-751 26 Uppsala
secretary@ecsi.se

DISTRIBUTOR:

eddy.se ab
Box 1310
SE-621 24 Visby

For general information, see www.ecsi.se
For subscriptions, prices and delivery, see <http://ecsi.bokorder.se>
Published with the aid of a grant from The Swedish Research Council
The English text was revised by Rebecca Montague, Hindon, Salisbury, UK

Opuscula is a peer reviewed journal. Contributions to *Opuscula* should be sent to the Secretary of the Editorial Committee before 1 November every year. Contributors are requested to include an abstract summarizing the main points and principal conclusions of their article. For style of references to be adopted, see www.ecsi.se/guides-contributors. Books for review should be sent to the Secretary of the Editorial Committee.

ISSN 2000-0898

ISBN 978-91-977798-9-0

© Svenska Institutet i Athen and Svenska Institutet i Rom

Printed by Elanders, Sverige AB, Mölnlycke 2017

Cover illustration from N.-P. Yioutsos in this volume, p. 172

I. McPhee, *Myth, Drama and Style in South Italian Vase-Painting: Selected Papers by A.D. Trendall* (Studies in Mediterranean Archaeology and Literature PB 182), Uppsala: Åströms Förlag 2016. xxxix + 299 pp. ISBN 978-91-7081-205-7.

A collection of Arthur Dale Trendall's most important articles, some of which have so far not been easy to access, is of especial importance today as we are witnessing a growing interest in the field of South Italian vases. Regardless the quantity and quality of the material and the arduous work devoted to it by a handful of scholars, this field of study has not as yet received the level of attention it merits. A still rather common Athenocentric perspective has resulted in a situation where ceramics and other objects from around 1,500 (non-Athenian) city-states have sometimes been overlooked. Therefore there certainly is scope for expanding our horizons.

This book is the first publication of the Trendall Research Centre at La Trobe University in Melbourne and begins with a foreword by its present director Gillian Shepherd, a scholar with many interests, who has carried out research on the peoples of Magna Graecia. The Centre is visited by scholars from all over the world, the writer of this review amongst them, and preserves more than 40,000 pictures of South Italian vases as well as housing Trendall's vast personal library which has been further augmented during the last decades.

Ian McPhee is the editor of the book and has selected the articles as well as written a chapter on Trendall's personal and academic life. Arthur Dale Trendall was born in New Zealand in 1909 and was, together with John Davies Beazley, one of the foremost authorities in the field of Greek vase-painting during the past century. His legacy has a tremendous influence on the subject of Classical Studies, particularly so in his native New Zealand, and in Australia. One of Trendall's many extraordinary achievements worth highlighting is his role in the advancement of Australian higher educational policies and as one of the founding fathers of the Australian Academy of Humanities. During the war Trendall successfully led a group of Australian cryptographers who decrypted Japanese diplomatic signals, an activity which considerably contributed to the shortening of the war.

McPhee reasons his choice of the 21 articles published here: the rationale was to include both scholarly and more popular texts along with providing examples of Trendall's methods and views on stylistic variances between individual painters and regional sub-divisions (i.e. Apulian, Campanian, Lucanian, and Sicilian) of South Italian vase-painting. These questions are still relevant to anyone working on vases despite the slightly condescending view on these aspects within the contemporary academic society (see for instance the discussion between Oakley and Whitley in the late 1990s). The is-

ues are nonetheless important in fieldwork activity as knowledge of them not only helps to identify local populations (as there is a substantial difference between the shapes and images chosen for grave vases in Greek colonies versus indigenous sites) and trade routes, but also lets us date sites with as accurate precision as possible.

The book is divided in three major subsections: images which depict mythological scenes (seven articles), images which depict scenes from drama (five articles), and finally questions regarding style (nine articles). These sub-divisions seem rather obvious: mythological and dramatic imagery plays a prominent role in South Italian vase-painting. The chosen topics are, however, also indicative of other motives that – for the reasons stated above – have not received enough attention until today, such as genre scenes or paintings with chthonic symbolism.

The mythological scenes treated here are those of Poseidon and Anymone, Callisto, the rape of Persephone, Medea at Eleusis, Amphion and Zethos, and finally the daughters of Anios. Six first articles are dedicated to comparing individual scenes on vases with then-known depictions in the pictorial record; these scenes were new to Trendall at the time. Thus, Trendall provides us with a framework of how a certain mythological scene is to be identified starting from its general composition and various attributes appearing on the scene. The fourth chapter discusses a volute krater depicting a unique scene, namely the visit of Medea to Eleusis (where both Medea and the temple are identified by inscriptions, the temple as “Eleusis: the Shrine”). This article can be regarded as a masterpiece in its description of the painting and its style, and in its method for identifying a painter's hand. The article is also of importance since it is here that Trendall rightly concluded that the image probably serves as a proof for an existence of an alternative ending to the Medea myth in which Medea protected her children instead of killing them – something which seems to be confirmed by a papyrus published much later (in 2006). The seventh chapter presents an interpretation of a couple of scenes by the Darius painter which until then had remained unexplained and highlights the author's scrupulous work.

The section addressing depictions of drama contains two articles on more general themes. They deal with issues such as “farce and tragedy in South Italian vase-painting” and “masks on Apulian red-figured vases”, and three articles which each engage with a specific vase-painting. The chapter on farce and tragedy evidences the importance of Dionysos in dramatic scenes, as to his role as god of the drama as well as to that of the afterlife. Trendall argues that these aspects in the nature of Dionysos were amalgamated on many symposium vases where Dionysos appears in the role of the god of wine. Dionysos and the figures connected to him, such as satyrs, are thus effectively seen in many images with a connection to drama.

Trendall also gives accounts of many 'Phlyax' vases which depict comic actors and scenes. These images can also be connected to Dionysos since many of the plays were performed in his honour. Representations of tragedy are also discussed here. Some scenes are indicated with inscriptions identifying the characters, yet in others this is possible only through meticulous examination of figures and attributes in a variety of contexts. This task is complex since the figures on the 'tragic scenes' are usually not depicted wearing theatre masks.

Three first chapters in the third section concentrating on regional styles and painters provide a good introduction to the features that characterize the Sicilian style. This style was first recognized and set apart as an autonomous style in the 1950s. This lateness in stylistic observations reflects, I believe, both the difficulties the scholarship has encountered regarding South Italian vase-painting and the practical utility of the classification methods elaborated by Trendall and his colleagues. The discussion regarding the Sicilian Borelli, Lugano and Checker painters as well as the Lentini-Manfria and Borelli groups provides the reader with useful information concerning the recognition of painters and workshops. Two following articles concern the Campanian style, and the Libation Painter, together with a previously unknown painter. Another article concerns the Lucanian style including the Painter of the Berlin Dancing Girl and the Primato Painter. The section ends with three articles on the Apulian style discussing the Felton, Truro and Darius painters.

One of the differences between Trendall's and Beazley's works is that Trendall provided a more thorough description of how to identify traits of different painters' hands. This issue is reflected very well in these articles. Trendall's work is a very useful methodological tool for a student entering the field. Regardless of the critical views within the field, this branch of the ancient studies requires skills which do not in fact differ much from the skills needed when telling apart paintings by the surrealists Joan Miró and Wassily Kandinsky.

The publication ends with indices of collections, painters, and groups, together with a 13-page long list of Trendall's publications spanning a period of over 65 years, from the year 1932 to posthumous publications in 1996 and 1997. Trendall's production encompasses more than 220 published texts of which only a tenth were written in cooperation with others (mostly with the Australians Alexander Cambitoglou and Ian McPhee) – an achievement which will hardly be surpassed.

The book displays a good layout and the placement of the different sections is well thought-out. Both the old references and the new ones added by McPhee are very thorough and the abbreviations are easily located in the list of abbreviations in the beginning of the book. The articles have been chosen with great care and give a very good introduction to the field of South Italian vase-painting as well as to the problems of styles

and attributions. They serve the interests of scholars, students and the general public alike. My only reservation concerns the sizes of the reproductions of the vases; images with the sizes of the original publications would in my opinion better served the purpose. In sum, I believe that this book well merits its place in a book shelf of anyone interested in vase-painting, especially of those preoccupied with vase-painting of Magna Graecia.

PEDRO BENTANCOUR GARIN
Department of Archaeology and Classical Studies
Stockholm University
SE 106 91 Stockholm
pedro.bentancour@antiken.su.se

G. Renberg, *Where dreams may come. Incubation sanctuaries in the Greco-Roman world*, vols. 1–2 (Religions in the Greco-Roman world 184), Leiden & Boston: Brill 2016. 1046 pp. ISBN 978-90-04-29976-4 (hardback set) ISBN 978-90-04-34621-5 (hardback, vol. 1) ISBN 978-90-04-34622-2 (hardback, vol. 2) ISBN 978-90-04-33023-8 (e-book).

Incubation, or the ritualized sleep in a holy place in order to receive a healing or an oracle, has long been subject to scholarly fascination and many previous studies.

The aim of the author is to document (or disprove) all sanctuaries in the Greco-Roman world (including Egypt, and to a certain extent Mesopotamia and the Early Christian world) that have been claimed to be places of incubation. The author carefully evaluates the literary, epigraphical and archaeological evidence for ritual sleep in sanctuaries, making the testimonia available also for non-Classicists.

The book consists of two volumes: one with the text proper, and one with 17 appendices, bibliography and indices.

21 architectural plans and 59 good quality figures clarify the account. The index locorum comprises 47 pages, including museum collections, published Greco-Roman works of art, and textual sources arranged after geographical provenance. This tool is very valuable when looking for specific categories of evidence or if you quickly want to find references for a particular relief or text passage.

The appendices consist of thematic studies, which could not be fitted within the site-by-site survey of the book proper. Here we find catalogues of sites previously but wrongly linked to incubation, other direct oracular techniques which did not involve dreams (e.g. voice oracles), and two very useful illustrated catalogues of incubation reliefs. One or two of the appendices might have been worked into the site-by-site account of the book proper, such as the ones on preparatory